



## ON WEAKLY LANDSBERG FOURTH ROOT $(\alpha, \beta)$ -METRICS

A. TAYEBI AND N. IZADIAN

**ABSTRACT.** In this paper, we consider one of open problems in Finsler geometry which have been proposed by Z. Shen about the existence of non-Berwaldian Landsberg 4-th root metric. We show that every weakly Landsberg (and then Landsberg) 4-th root  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metric is a Berwald metric.

### 1. INTRODUCTION

In Finsler geometry, there is a non-Riemannian quantity which is determined by the Busemann-Hausdorff volume form, that is the so called distortion  $\tau = \tau(x, y)$ . The vertical differential of  $\tau$  on each tangent space gives rise to the mean Cartan torsion  $\mathbf{I} := \tau_{y^k} dx^k$ . The horizontal derivative of  $\mathbf{I}$  along geodesics is called the mean Landsberg curvature  $\mathbf{J} := \mathbf{I}_{|k} y^k$ . Finsler metrics with  $\mathbf{J} = 0$  are called weakly Landsberg metrics. The mean Landsberg curvature  $\mathbf{J}_y$  is the rate of change of  $\mathbf{I}_y$  along geodesics for any  $y \in T_x M_0$ . It has been shown that on a weakly Landsberg manifold, the volume function  $V = Vol(x)$  is a constant [5]. The constancy of the volume function is required to establish a Gauss-Bonnet theorem for Finsler manifolds [4]. There is an induced Riemannian metric of Sasaki type on  $TM_0$ . In [11], Shen showed that if  $\mathbf{J} = 0$ , then all the slit tangent spaces  $T_x M_0$  are minimal in  $TM_0$ . Some rigidity problems also lead to weakly Landsberg manifolds. For example, for a closed Finsler manifold of non-positive flag curvature, if the S-curvature is a constant, then it is weakly Landsbergian [12]. Apparently, weakly Landsberg Finsler manifolds deserve further investigation.

Let  $(M, F)$  be an  $n$ -dimensional Finsler manifold,  $TM$  its tangent bundle and  $(x^i, y^i)$  the coordinates in a local chart on  $TM$ . Let  $F = F(x, y)$  be a scalar function on  $TM$  defined by  $F = \sqrt[m]{A}$ , where  $A := a_{i_1 \dots i_m}(x) y^{i_1} y^{i_2} \dots y^{i_m}$  and  $a_{i_1 \dots i_m}$  is symmetric in all its indices.  $F$  is called an  $m$ -th root Finsler metric. The theory of  $m$ -th root metrics has been developed by Shimada [14], and applied to Biology as an ecological metric by Antonelli [1]. The fourth root metrics  $F = \sqrt[4]{a_{ijkl}(x) y^i y^j y^k y^l}$  are called the quartic metric. It is remarkable that, the special 4-th root metric  $F = \sqrt[4]{(y^1)^4 + \dots + (y^n)^4}$  represents the historic primary Finsler fundamental function considered by Riemann in his "Habilitation address". The recent attempts of modeling relativity

2010 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* 53B40, 53C60.

*Key words and phrases.* Landsberg metric, weakly Landsberg metric, Berwald metric.

based on a palette of physical models relying on the 4-th root Finsler metrics. The 4-th root metric  $F = \sqrt[4]{y^1 y^2 y^3 y^4}$  is called Berwald-Moór metric which plays an important role in theory of space-time structure, gravitation and general relativity [2] [3]. For more progress, see [6], [10], [15], [17], [18], [19], [22] and [23].

In [8], Matsumoto proved that every 3-th root Finsler metric with vanishing Landsberg curvature is a Berwald metric. But he had not any progress for the class of 4-th root metrics with vanishing Landsberg curvature. Since the study of the class of 4-th root metrics becomes urgent necessity for the Finsler geometry as well as for theoretical physics, then in [13] Shen introduced the following open problem:

*Is there any non-Berwaldian Landsberg 4-th root Finsler metric?*

The class of weakly Landsberg metrics contains the class of Landsberg metrics as a special case. In this paper, we are going to prove the following.

**Theorem 1.1.** *Let  $F = F(x, y)$  be a 4-th root  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metric on a manifold  $M$  of dimension  $n \geq 3$ . Then  $F$  is a weakly Landsberg metric if and only if it is a Berwald metric.*

## 2. PRELIMINARIES

Let  $M$  be a  $n$ -dimensional  $C^\infty$  manifold and  $TM = \bigcup_{x \in M} T_x M$  the tangent bundle. Let  $(M, F)$  be a Finsler manifold. The following quadratic form  $\mathbf{g}_y$  on  $T_x M$  is called fundamental tensor

$$\mathbf{g}_y(u, v) = \frac{1}{2} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s \partial t} \left[ F^2(y + su + tv) \right] \Big|_{s=t=0}, \quad u, v \in T_x M.$$

For  $y \in T_x M_0$ , define  $\mathbf{C}_y : T_x M \otimes T_x M \otimes T_x M \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  by

$$\mathbf{C}_y(u, v, w) := \frac{1}{2} \frac{d}{dt} \left[ \mathbf{g}_{y+tw}(u, v) \right]_{t=0} = \frac{1}{4} \frac{\partial^3}{\partial r \partial s \partial t} \left[ F^2(y + ru + sv + tw) \right]_{r=s=t=0},$$

where  $u, v, w \in T_x M$ . By definition,  $\mathbf{C}_y$  is a symmetric trilinear form on  $T_x M$ . The family  $\mathbf{C} := \{\mathbf{C}_y\}_{y \in TM_0}$  is called the Cartan torsion. For  $y \in T_x M_0$ , define  $\mathbf{I}_y : T_x M \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  by  $\mathbf{I}_y(u) = \sum_{i=1}^n g^{ij}(y) \mathbf{C}_y(u, \partial_i, \partial_j)$ , where  $\{\partial_i\}$  is a basis for  $T_x M$  at  $x \in M$ . The family  $\mathbf{I} := \{\mathbf{I}_y\}_{y \in TM_0}$  is called the mean Cartan torsion. Thus,  $\mathbf{I}_y(u) := I_i(y) u^i$ , where  $I_i := g^{jk} C_{ijk}$ . By Deicke's theorem,  $F$  is Riemannian if and only if  $\mathbf{I}_y = 0$ .

For a vector  $y \in T_x M$ , the Landsberg and mean Landsberg curvature of  $F$  can be defined by following

$$\mathbf{L}_y(u, v, w) := \frac{d}{dt} \left[ \mathbf{C}_{\dot{\sigma}(t)}(U(t), V(t), W(t)) \right] \Big|_{t=0}, \quad \mathbf{J}_y(u) := \frac{d}{dt} \left[ \mathbf{I}_{\dot{\sigma}(t)}(U(t)) \right] \Big|_{t=0},$$

where  $\sigma(t)$  is the geodesic with  $\sigma(0) = x$ ,  $\dot{\sigma}(0) = y$  and  $U(t), V(t), W(t)$  are linearly parallel vector fields along  $\sigma$  with  $U(0) = u, V(0) = v, W(0) = w$ . In this case, the Landsberg curvature (resp. mean Landsberg curvature) measures the rate of change of the Cartan (resp. mean Cartan) torsion along geodesics.

Given a Finsler manifold  $(M, F)$ , then a global vector field  $\mathbf{G}$  is induced by  $F$  on  $TM_0$ , which in a standard coordinate  $(x^i, y^i)$  for  $TM_0$  is given by  $\mathbf{G} = y^i \frac{\partial}{\partial x^i} - 2G^i \frac{\partial}{\partial y^i}$ , where  $G^i = G^i(x, y)$  are local functions on  $TM_0$  satisfying  $G^i(x, \lambda y) = \lambda^2 G^i(x, y)$ ,  $\lambda > 0$ , and given by

$$G^i = \frac{1}{4} g^{il} \left[ \frac{\partial^2 F^2}{\partial x^k \partial y^l} y^k - \frac{\partial F^2}{\partial x^l} \right].$$

The vector field  $\mathbf{G}$  is called the associated spray to  $(M, F)$ . The projection of an integral curve of the spray  $\mathbf{G}$  is called a geodesic in  $M$ .

Define  $\mathbf{B}_y : T_x M \otimes T_x M \otimes T_x M \rightarrow T_x M$  by  $\mathbf{B}_y(u, v, w) := B^i{}_{jkl}(y) u^j v^k w^l \frac{\partial}{\partial x^i} \Big|_x$ , where

$$B^i{}_{jkl} := \frac{\partial^3 G^i}{\partial y^j \partial y^k \partial y^l} = \frac{\partial^2 N_j^i}{\partial y^k \partial y^l}.$$

$\mathbf{B}_y(u, v, w)$  is symmetric in  $u, v$  and  $w$ .  $\mathbf{B}$  is called the Berwald curvature.  $F$  is called a Berwald metric if  $\mathbf{B} = \mathbf{0}$ .

### 3. PROOF OF THEOREM 1.1

In order to prove Theorem 1.1, we need the following.

**Lemma 3.1.** *Let  $F = \sqrt[4]{A}$  be a 4-th root metric on a manifold  $M$ , where  $A = a_{ijkl} y^i y^j y^k y^l$ . If  $\dim(M) \geq 3$  and  $F$  is a function of a non-degenerate quadratic form  $\alpha^2 = \alpha_{ij}(x) y^i y^j$  and a one-form  $\beta = \beta_i(x) y^i$  which is homogeneous in  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$  of degree one, then it is written in the form  $F = \sqrt[4]{c_1 \alpha^4 + c_2 \alpha^2 \beta^2 + c_3 \beta^4}$ , where  $c_1, c_2$  and  $c_3$  are real constants.*

*Proof.* By the same argument used in [9] for the cubic metrics admitting  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metrics, we get the proof.  $\square$

Let  $F = \alpha \phi(s)$ ,  $s = \beta/\alpha$ , be an  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metric, where  $\phi = \phi(s)$  is a  $C^\infty$  on  $(-b_0, b_0)$  with certain regularity,  $\alpha = \sqrt{a_{ij}(x) y^i y^j}$  is a Riemannian metric and  $\beta = b_i(x) y^i$  is a 1-form on a manifold  $M$  (see [16], [22] and [23]). Let  $G^i = G^i(x, y)$  and  $G_\alpha^i = G_\alpha^i(x, y)$  denote the coefficients of  $F$  and  $\alpha$ , respectively, in the same coordinate system. For an  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metric, let us define  $b_{ij}$  by  $b_{ij} \theta^j := db_i - b_j \theta_i^j$ , where  $\theta^i := dx^i$  and  $\theta_i^j := \Gamma_{ik}^j dx^k$  denote the Levi-Civita connection form of  $\alpha$ . Let

$$\begin{aligned} r_{ij} &:= \frac{1}{2}(b_{i|j} + b_{j|i}), & s_{ij} &:= \frac{1}{2}(b_{i|j} - b_{j|i}), & r_{i0} &:= r_{ij} y^j, & r_{00} &:= r_{ij} y^i y^j, & r_j &:= b^i r_{ij}, \\ s_{i0} &:= s_{ij} y^j, & s_j &:= b^i s_{ij}, & s^i{}_j &:= a^{im} s_{mj}, & s^i{}_0 &:= s^i{}_j y^j, & r_0 &:= r_j y^j, & s_0 &:= s_j y^j. \end{aligned}$$

where  $a^{ij} = (a_{ij})^{-1}$  and  $b^i := a^{ij} b_j$ . Put

$$\begin{aligned} Q &:= \frac{\phi'}{\phi - s\phi'}, & \Delta &:= 1 + sQ + (b^2 - s^2)Q', & \Theta &:= \frac{Q - sQ'}{2\Delta}, \\ \Psi &:= \frac{Q'}{2\Delta} = \frac{\phi''}{2[(\phi - s\phi') + (b^2 - s^2)\phi'']}. \end{aligned}$$

By definition, we have

$$G^i = G_\alpha^i + \alpha Q s_0^i + (r_{00} - 2Q\alpha s_0)(\alpha^{-1}\Theta y^i + \Psi b^i). \quad (1)$$

where

$$P := \alpha^{-1}\Theta[-2Q\alpha s_0 + r_{00}], \quad Q^i := \alpha Q s_0^i + \Psi[-2Q\alpha s_0 + r_{00}]b^i.$$

Clearly, if  $\beta$  is parallel with respect to  $\alpha$ , that is  $r_{ij} = 0$  and  $s_{ij} = 0$ , then  $P = 0$  and  $Q^i = 0$ . In this case,  $G^i = G_\alpha^i$  are quadratic in  $y$ . In this case,  $F$  is a Berwald metric.

Put

$$\Phi := -(Q - sQ')\{n\Delta + 1 + sQ\} - (b^2 - s^2)(1 + sQ)Q''.$$

By a direct computation, we can obtain a formula for the mean Cartan torsion of  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metrics as follows

$$I_i = -\frac{\Phi(\phi - s\phi')}{2\Delta\phi\alpha^2}(\alpha b_i - s y_i). \quad (2)$$

According to Deicke's theorem, a Finsler metric is Riemannian if and only if  $\mathbf{I} = 0$ . Clearly, an  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metric  $F = \alpha\phi(s)$  is Riemannian if and only if  $\Phi = 0$ . Then by Theorem 1.1 in [7], we get the following.

**Lemma 3.2.** ([7]) *Let  $F = \alpha\phi(\frac{\beta}{\alpha})$  be an almost regular  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metric on an  $n$ -dimensional manifold  $M(n \geq 3)$ , where  $\alpha = \sqrt{a_{ij}y^i y^j}$  and  $\beta = b_i y^i$ . Suppose that  $\beta$  is not parallel with respect to  $\alpha$  and  $\phi \neq k_1\sqrt{1 + k_2 s^2}$  for any constants  $k_1$  and  $k_2$ . Let  $b(x) := \|\beta_x\|_\alpha \neq 0$ . Then  $F$  is a weakly Landsberg metric if and only if  $\beta$  satisfies*

$$r_{ij} = k(b^2 a_{ij} - b_i b_j), \quad s_{ij} = 0, \quad (3)$$

where  $k = k(x)$  is a scalar function on  $M$  and  $\phi = \phi(s)$  satisfies

$$\Phi = \frac{\lambda}{\sqrt{b^2 - s^2}}\Delta^{\frac{3}{2}}, \quad (4)$$

where  $\lambda$  is a constant.

**Proof of Theorem 1.1:** For an  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metric  $F = \alpha\phi(s)$ , the mean Landsberg curvature is given by

$$\begin{aligned} J_i = & -\frac{1}{2\Delta\alpha^4} \left[ \frac{2\alpha^2}{b^2 - s^2} \left[ \frac{\Phi}{\Delta} + (n+1)(Q - sQ') \right] (r_0 + s_0) h_i \right. \\ & + \frac{\alpha}{b^2 - s^2} (\Psi_1 + s \frac{\Phi}{\Delta}) (r_{00} - 2\alpha Q s_0) h_i + \alpha \left[ -\alpha Q' s_0 h_i + \alpha Q (\alpha^2 s_i - y_i s_0) \right. \\ & \left. \left. + \alpha^2 \Delta s_{i0} + \alpha^2 (r_{i0} - 2\alpha Q s_i) - (r_{00} - 2\alpha Q s_0) y_i \right] \frac{\Phi}{\Delta} \right]. \quad (5) \end{aligned}$$

where

$$\Psi_1 := \sqrt{b^2 - s^2} \Delta^{\frac{1}{2}} \left[ \frac{\sqrt{b^2 - s^2} \Phi}{\Delta^{\frac{3}{2}}} \right]', \quad h_i := b_i - \alpha^{-1} s y_i.$$

By Lemmas 3.1 and 3.2, the mean Landsberg curvature of a 4-th root metric is given by following

$$J_i := \lambda(Ab_i + By_i), \quad (6)$$

where  $A$  and  $B$  are listed in Appendix, and

$$\lambda := 1/T \left[ 2c_1c_2(b^2\alpha^2 + 2\beta^2)\alpha^2 + (12c_1c_3 - c_2^2)b^2\alpha^2\beta^2 + 2b^2\beta^4c_2c_3 + 4\alpha^4c_1^2 - 8\beta^4c_1c_3 + 3\beta^4c_2^2 \right]^3.$$

where  $T := -(2c_1\alpha^2 + c_2\beta^2)$ . By assumption,  $J_i = 0$ . Contracting it with  $b^i$  implies that

$$k \left[ d_8\alpha^{14} + d_7\beta^2\alpha^{12} + d_6\beta^4\alpha^{10} + d_5\beta^6\alpha^8 + d_4\beta^8\alpha^6 + d_3\beta^{10}\alpha^4 + d_2\beta^{12}\alpha^2 + d_1\beta^{14} \right] = 0, \quad (7)$$

where  $d_i$  ( $i = 1, \dots, 8$ ) are given by following

$$d_8 := -96c_1^4b^6(4c_1c_3 - c_2^2)(b^2c_2 + 2c_1),$$

$$d_7 := 48b^4c_1^3(4c_1c_3 - c_2^2)(nb^4c_2^2 + 24b^4c_1c_3 - 6b^4c_2^2 + 4nb^2c_1c_2 + 14nb^2c_1c_2 + 4c_1^2 + 28c_1^2),$$

$$d_6 := 8b^2c_1^2(4c_1c_3 - c_2^2) \left( 60nb^6c_1c_2c_3 - 4nb^6c_2^3 + 144b^6c_1c_2c_3 - 7b^6c_2^3 + 120nb^4c_1^2c_3 - 576b^4c_1^2c_3 \right. \\ \left. + 318b^4c_1c_2^2 - 12nb^2c_1^2c_2 + 96b^2c_1^2c_2 - 56nc_1^3 - 272c_1^3 \right),$$

$$d_5 := 4c_1(4c_1c_3 - c_2^2) \left( 288nb^8c_1^2c_3^2 - 20nb^8c_1c_2^2c_3 + nb^8c_2^4 - 288b^8c_1^2c_3^2 + 328b^8c_1c_2^2c_3 - 8b^8c_2^4 \right. \\ \left. - 104nb^6c_1^2c_2c_3 + 28nb^6c_1c_2^3 - 704b^6c_1^2c_2c_3 + 334b^6c_1c_2^3 - 704nb^4c_1^3c_3 + 32nb^4c_1^2c_2^2 + 2176b^4c_1^3c_3 \right. \\ \left. - 940b^4c_1^2c_2^2 - 152nb^2c_1^3c_2 - 848b^2c_1^3c_2 + 64nc_1^4 + 256c_1^4 \right),$$

$$d_4 := 8c_1(4c_1c_3 - c_2^2) \left( 36nb^8c_1c_2c_3^2 - 3nb^8c_2^3c_3 + 60b^8c_1c_2c_3^2 + 24b^8c_2^3c_3 - 504nb^6c_1^2c_3^2 - 5nb^6c_2^4 \right. \\ \left. + 94nb^6c_1c_2^2c_3 + 696b^6c_1^2c_3^2 - 392b^6c_1c_2^2c_3 + 40b^6c_2^4 - 212nb^4c_1^2c_2c_3 - nb^4c_1c_2^3 + 616b^4c_1^2c_2c_3 \right. \\ \left. - 370b^4c_1c_2^3 + 328nb^2c_1^3c_3 - 94nb^2c_1^2c_2^2 - 1040b^2c_1^3c_3 + 92b^2c_1^2c_2^2 + 64nc_1^3c_2 + 256c_1^3c_2 \right),$$

$$d_3 := -4(4c_1c_3 - c_2^2) \left( 8nb^8c_1c_2^2c_3^2 - nb^8c_2^4c_3 - 64b^8c_1c_2^2c_3^2 + 8b^8c_2^4c_3 + 248nb^6c_1^2c_2c_3^2 - nb^6c_2^5 \right. \\ \left. - 10nb^6c_1c_2^3c_3 + 104b^6c_1^2c_2c_3^2 + 80b^6c_1c_2^3c_3 - 1264nb^4c_1^3c_3^2 + 500nb^4c_1^2c_2^2c_3 - 832b^4c_1^2c_2^2c_3 \right. \\ \left. + 8b^6c_2^5 - 25nb^4c_1c_2^4 + 2192b^4c_1^3c_3^2 + 200b^4c_1c_2^4 - 600nb^2c_1^3c_2c_3 + 98nb^2c_1^2c_2^3 + 1584b^2c_1^3c_2c_3 \right. \\ \left. - 768c_1^4c_3 - 484b^2c_1^2c_2^3 + 192nc_1^4c_3 - 144nc_1^3c_2^2 - 192c_1^3c_2^2 \right),$$

$$d_2 := -8(4c_1c_3 - c_2^2) \left( nb^8c_2^3c_3^2 + b^8c_2^3c_3^2 - 2nb^6c_1c_2^2c_3^2 + 3nb^6c_2^4c_3 + 70b^6c_1c_2^2c_3^2 - 6b^6c_2^4c_3 \right. \\ \left. - 128nb^4c_1^2c_2c_3^2 + 15nb^4c_1c_2^3c_3 + 2nb^4c_2^5 + 88b^4c_1^2c_2c_3^2 + 6b^4c_1c_2^3c_3 - 7b^4c_2^5 + 336nb^2c_1^3c_3^2 \right. \\ \left. - 222nb^2c_1^2c_2^2c_3 + 20nb^2c_1c_2^4 - 672b^2c_1^3c_3^2 + 348b^2c_1^2c_2^2c_3 - 88b^2c_1c_2^4 + 96nc_1^3c_2c_3 - 40nc_1^2c_2^3 \right. \\ \left. - 384c_1^3c_2c_3 + 32c_1^2c_2^3 \right),$$

$$d_1 := 4(4c_1c_3 - c_2^2) \left( 2nb^6c_2^3c_3^2 + 2b^6c_2^3c_3^2 + 4nb^4c_1c_2^2c_3^2 + 5nb^4c_2^4c_3 + 76b^4c_1c_2^2c_3^2 - 4nb^4c_2^4c_3 \right. \\ \left. - 80b^2c_1^2c_2c_3^2 + 26nb^2c_1c_2^3c_3 + 3nb^2c_2^5 + 160b^2c_1^2c_2c_3^2 + 44b^2c_1c_2^3c_3 - 6b^2c_2^5 + 128nc_1^3c_3^2 \right. \\ \left. - 112nc_1^2c_2^2c_3 + 24nc_1c_2^4 - 256c_1^3c_3^2 + 320c_1^2c_2^2c_3 - 48c_1c_2^4 \right).$$

If  $k \neq 0$ , then by (7) we get

$$d_1\beta^{14} = f\alpha^2, \quad (8)$$

where  $f = f(x, y)$  is a homogeneous scalar function of degrees 12 with respect to  $y$ . But, (8) contradict with the positive-definiteness of  $\alpha$ . Thus  $k = 0$ . Putting it in (3) implies  $r_{ij} = 0$ .  $\square$

**Remark 3.1.** By a simple calculation, for the 4-th root  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metric  $F = \sqrt[4]{c_1\alpha^4 + c_2\alpha^2\beta^2 + c_3\beta^4}$ , we get the following

$$\Delta = \frac{2b^2c_2c_3s^4 + 12b^2c_1c_3s^2 - b^2c_2^2s^2 - 8c_1c_3s^4 + 3c_2^2s^4 + 2b^2c_1c_2 + 4c_1c_2s^2 + c_1^2}{(c_2s^2 + 2c_1)^2},$$

$$\Phi = \frac{-2s}{(c_2s^2 + 2c_1)^4} \left( -8nb^2c_1c_2c_3^2s^6 + 2nb^2c_2^3c_3s^6 - 8b^2c_1c_2c_3^2s^6 + 2b^2c_2^3c_3s^6 - 48nb^2c_1^2c_3^2s^4 \right. \\ \left. + 16nb^2c_1c_2^2c_3s^4 - nb^2c_2^4s^4 + 32nc_1^2c_3^2s^6 - 20nc_1c_2^2c_3s^6 + 3nc_2^4s^6 + 48b^2c_1^2c_3^2s^4 - 20b^2c_1c_2^2c_3s^4 \right. \\ \left. + 2b^2c_2^4s^4 - 64c_1^2c_3^2s^6 + 16c_1c_2^2c_3s^6 - 8nb^2c_1^2c_2c_3s^2 + 2nb^2c_1c_2^3s^2 - 16nc_1^2c_2c_3s^4 + 4nc_1c_2^3s^4 \right. \\ \left. + 40b^2c_1^2c_2c_3s^2 - 10b^2c_1c_2^3s^2 - 64c_1^2c_2c_3s^4 + 16c_1c_2^3s^4 - 16nc_1^3c_3s^2 + 4nc_1^2c_2^2s^2 + 48b^2c_1^3c_3 \right).$$

Thus  $\sqrt{b^2 - s^2}\Phi/\sqrt{\Delta^3}$  is not a constant which shows that (4) is not hold. Then  $\beta$  is parallel with respect to  $\alpha$  and  $F$  reduces to a Berwald metric.

## 4. APPENDIX

$$\begin{aligned}
A := & -4k \left( 12n\alpha^{12}b^6\beta^2c_1^3c_2^4 - 48n\alpha^{12}b^6\beta^2c_1^4c_2^3c_3 - 480n\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^4c_1^4c_2c_3^2 + 152n\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^4c_1^3c_2^3c_3 - 8n\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^4c_1^2c_2^5 - 1152n\alpha^8b^6\beta^6c_1^4c_3^3 \right. \\
& + 368n\alpha^8b^6\beta^6c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 - 24n\alpha^8b^6\beta^6c_1^2c_2^4c_3 + n\alpha^8b^6\beta^6c_1c_2^6 - 288n\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1^3c_2c_3^3 + 96n\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 - 6n\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1c_2^5c_3 - 24\alpha^{14}b^6c_1^4c_2^3 \\
& + 32n\alpha^4b^6\beta^{10}c_1c_2^2c_3^3 - 12n\alpha^4b^6\beta^{10}c_1c_2^4c_3^2 + n\alpha^4b^6\beta^{10}c_2^6c_3 + 8n\alpha^2b^6\beta^{12}c_1c_2^3c_3^3 - 2n\alpha^2b^6\beta^{12}c_2^5c_3^2 + 96\alpha^{14}b^6c_1^5c_2c_3 - 1152\alpha^{12}b^6\beta^2c_1^5c_3^2 \\
& + 576\alpha^{12}b^6\beta^2c_1^4c_2^2c_3 - 72\alpha^{12}b^6\beta^2c_1^3c_2^4 - 1152\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^4c_1^4c_2c_3^2 + 344\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^4c_1^3c_2^3c_3 - 14\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^4c_1^2c_2^5 + 1152\alpha^8b^6\beta^6c_1^4c_3^3 - 8\alpha^4b^6\beta^{10}c_2^6c_3 \\
& - 1600\alpha^8b^6\beta^6c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 + 360\alpha^8b^6\beta^6c_1^2c_2^4c_3 - 8\alpha^8b^6\beta^6c_1c_2^6 - 480\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1^3c_2c_3^3 - 72\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 + 48\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1c_2^5c_3 - 256\alpha^4b^6\beta^{10}c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 \\
& + 96\alpha^4b^6\beta^{10}c_1c_2^4c_3^2 + 8\alpha^2b^6\beta^{12}c_1c_2^3c_3^3 - 2\alpha^2b^6\beta^{12}c_2^5c_3^2 - 192n\alpha^{12}b^4\beta^2c_1^5c_2c_3 + 48n\alpha^{12}b^4\beta^2c_1^4c_2^2 - 960n\alpha^{10}b^4\beta^4c_1^5c_3^2 + 192n\alpha^{10}b^4\beta^4c_1^4c_2^2c_3 \\
& + 12n\alpha^{10}b^4\beta^4c_1^3c_2^4 - 64n\alpha^8b^4\beta^6c_1^4c_2c_3^2 - 64n\alpha^8b^4\beta^6c_1^3c_2^3c_3 + 20n\alpha^8b^4\beta^6c_1^2c_2^5 + 2880n\alpha^6b^4\beta^8c_1^4c_3^3 - 1392n\alpha^6b^4\beta^8c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 + n\alpha^4b^4\beta^{10}c_2^6 \\
& + 204n\alpha^6b^4\beta^8c_1^2c_2^3 - 9n\alpha^6b^4\beta^8c_1c_2^5 + 704n\alpha^4b^4\beta^{10}c_1^3c_2^3c_3 - 192n\alpha^4b^4\beta^{10}c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 + 16n\alpha^2b^4\beta^{12}c_1^2c_2^2c_3^3 + 16n\alpha^2b^4\beta^{12}c_1c_2^4c_3^2 - 5n\alpha^2b^4\beta^{12}c_2^5c_3 \\
& + 192\alpha^{14}b^4c_1^6c_3 - 48\alpha^{14}b^4c_1^5c_2^2 - 576\alpha^{12}b^4\beta^2c_1^5c_2c_3 + 144\alpha^{12}b^4\beta^2c_1^4c_2^2c_3 + 3456\alpha^{10}b^4\beta^4c_1^5c_3^2 - 3120\alpha^{10}b^4\beta^4c_1^4c_2^2c_3 + 564\alpha^{10}b^4\beta^4c_1^3c_2^4 \\
& + 1664\alpha^8b^4\beta^6c_1^4c_2c_3^2 - 1696\alpha^8b^4\beta^6c_1^3c_2^3c_3 + 320\alpha^8b^4\beta^6c_1^2c_2^5 - 4416\alpha^6b^4\beta^8c_1^3c_3^3 + 2928\alpha^6b^4\beta^8c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 - 744\alpha^6b^4\beta^8c_1c_2^4c_3 + 72\alpha^6b^4\beta^8c_1c_2^6 \\
& - 64\alpha^4b^4\beta^{10}c_1^3c_2c_3^3 + 144\alpha^4b^4\beta^{10}c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 - 8\alpha^4b^4\beta^{10}c_2^7 + 304\alpha^2b^4\beta^{12}c_1^2c_2^2c_3^3 - 92\alpha^2b^4\beta^{12}c_1c_2^4c_3^2 + 4\alpha^2b^4\beta^{12}c_2^6c_3 - 192n\alpha^{12}b^2\beta^2c_1^6c_3 \\
& + 48n\alpha^{12}b^2\beta^2c_1^5c_2^2 - 96n\alpha^{10}b^2\beta^4c_1^5c_2c_3 + 24n\alpha^{10}b^2\beta^4c_1^4c_2^2 + 1856n\alpha^8b^2\beta^6c_1^5c_2^2 - 640n\alpha^8b^2\beta^6c_1^4c_2^3 + 44n\alpha^8b^2\beta^6c_1^3c_2^4 + 1632n\alpha^6b^2\beta^8c_1^2c_2^2 \\
& - 48n\alpha^6b^2\beta^8c_1^2c_2^3c_3 + 18n\alpha^6b^2\beta^8c_1c_2^5 - 21n\alpha^4b^2\beta^{10}c_1^4c_3^3 + 18n\alpha^4b^2\beta^{10}c_1^3c_2^2c_3 - 36n\alpha^4b^2\beta^{10}c_1^2c_2^4 + 16n\alpha^4b^2\beta^{10}c_1c_2^6 - 30n\alpha^2b^2\beta^{12}c_1^3c_2^3c_3 \\
& + 184n\alpha^2b^2\beta^{12}c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 - 14n\alpha^2b^2\beta^{12}c_1c_2^5c_3 - 3n\alpha^2b^2\beta^{12}c_2^7 - 1152\alpha^{12}b^2\beta^2c_1^6c_3 + 288\alpha^{12}b^2\beta^2c_1^5c_2^2 - 1344\alpha^{10}b^2\beta^4c_1^5c_2c_3 + 336\alpha^{10}b^2\beta^4c_1^4c_2^2 \\
& - 5248\alpha^8b^2\beta^6c_1^5c_3^2 + 2816\alpha^8b^2\beta^6c_1^4c_2^2c_3 - 376\alpha^8b^2\beta^6c_1^3c_2^4 - 3264\alpha^6b^2\beta^8c_1^4c_2c_3^2 + 2496\alpha^6b^2\beta^8c_1^3c_2^3c_3 - 420\alpha^6b^2\beta^8c_1^2c_2^5 + 4352\alpha^4b^2\beta^{10}c_1^4c_3^3 \\
& - 2592\alpha^4b^2\beta^{10}c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 + 888\alpha^4b^2\beta^{10}c_1^2c_2^4c_3 - 128\alpha^4b^2\beta^{10}c_1c_2^6 + 640\alpha^2b^2\beta^{12}c_1^3c_2c_3^3 + 16\alpha^2b^2\beta^{12}c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 - 68\alpha^2b^2\beta^{12}c_1c_2^5c_3 + 6\alpha^2b^2\beta^{12}c_2^7 \\
& + 256n\alpha^{10}b^4c_1^6c_3 - 64n\alpha^{10}b^4c_1^5c_2^2 + 512n\alpha^8b^6c_1^5c_2c_3 - 12n\alpha^8b^6c_1^4c_2^3 - 768n\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1^5c_3^2 + 768n\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1^4c_2^2c_3 - 144n\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1^3c_2^4 - 192\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1^3c_2^6 \\
& - 768n\alpha^4b^{10}c_1^4c_2c_3^2 + 512n\alpha^4b^{10}c_1^3c_2^3c_3 - 80n\alpha^4b^{10}c_1^2c_2^5 + 512n\alpha^2b^{12}c_1^4c_3^3 - 576n\alpha^2b^{12}c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 + 208n\alpha^2b^{12}c_1^2c_2^4c_3 - 24n\alpha^2b^{12}c_1^2c_2^6 \\
& + 1024\alpha^{10}b^4c_1^6c_3 - 256\alpha^{10}b^4c_1^5c_2^2 + 2048\alpha^8b^6c_1^5c_2c_3 - 512\alpha^8b^6c_1^4c_2^3 + 3072\alpha^6b^6\beta^8c_1^5c_3^2 + 3072\alpha^4b^{10}c_1^4c_2c_3^2 - 1024\alpha^4b^{10}c_1^3c_2^3c_3 + 64\alpha^4b^{10}c_1^2c_2^5 \\
& \left. - 1024\alpha^2\beta^{12}c_1^4c_3^3 + 1536\alpha^2\beta^{12}c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 - 512\alpha^2\beta^{12}c_1^2c_2^4c_3 + 48\alpha^2\beta^{12}c_1c_2^6 \right), \\
B := & -4k \left( 48n\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^3c_1^4c_2^2c_3 - 12n\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^3c_1^3c_2^4 + 480n\alpha^8b^6\beta^5c_1^4c_2c_3^2 - 152n\alpha^8b^6\beta^5c_1^3c_2^3c_3 + 8n\alpha^8b^6\beta^5c_1^2c_2^5 + 1152n\alpha^6b^6\beta^7c_1^4c_3^3 - n\alpha^6b^6\beta^7c_1c_2^6 \right. \\
& - 368n\alpha^6b^6\beta^7c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 + 24n\alpha^6b^6\beta^7c_1^2c_2^4c_3 + 288n\alpha^4b^6\beta^9c_1^3c_2c_3^3 - 96n\alpha^4b^6\beta^9c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 + 6n\alpha^4b^6\beta^9c_1c_2^5c_3 - 3n\alpha^2b^6\beta^{11}c_1^2c_2^2c_3^3 + 12n\alpha^2b^6\beta^{11}c_1c_2^4c_3^2 \\
& - \alpha^2b^6\beta^{11}c_2^6c_3 - 8n\alpha^6b^6\beta^{13}c_1c_2^3c_3^3 + 2n\alpha^6b^6\beta^{13}c_2^5c_3^2 - 96\alpha^{12}b^6\beta^5c_1^2c_2c_3 + 24\alpha^{12}b^6\beta^5c_1c_2^4 + 1152\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^3c_1^5c_2^2 - 576\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^3c_1^4c_2^2c_3 + 72\alpha^{10}b^6\beta^3c_1^3c_2^4 \\
& + 1152\alpha^8b^6\beta^5c_1^4c_2c_3^2 - 344\alpha^8b^6\beta^5c_1^3c_2^2c_3 + 14\alpha^8b^6\beta^5c_1^2c_2^5 - 1152\alpha^6b^6\beta^7c_1^4c_3^3 + 1600\alpha^6b^6\beta^7c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 - 360\alpha^6b^6\beta^7c_1^2c_2^4c_3 + 8\alpha^6b^6\beta^7c_1c_2^6 \\
& + 480\alpha^4b^6\beta^9c_1^3c_2c_3^3 + 72\alpha^4b^6\beta^9c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 - 48\alpha^4b^6\beta^9c_1c_2^5c_3 + 256\alpha^2b^6\beta^{11}c_1^2c_2^3c_3^3 - 96\alpha^2b^6\beta^{11}c_1c_2^4c_3^2 + 8\alpha^2b^6\beta^{11}c_2^6c_3 - 8b^6\beta^{13}c_1c_2^3c_3^3 + 2b^6\beta^{13}c_2^5c_3^2 \\
& + 192n\alpha^{10}b^4\beta^3c_1^5c_2c_3 - 48n\alpha^{10}b^4\beta^3c_1^4c_2^3 + 960n\alpha^8b^4\beta^5c_1^5c_3^2 - 192n\alpha^8b^4\beta^5c_1^4c_2^2c_3 - 12n\alpha^8b^4\beta^5c_1^3c_2^4 + 64n\alpha^6b^4\beta^7c_1^4c_2c_3^2 + 64n\alpha^6b^4\beta^7c_1^3c_2^3c_3 \\
& - 20n\alpha^6b^4\beta^7c_1^2c_2^5 - 2880n\alpha^4b^4\beta^9c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 - 204n\alpha^4b^4\beta^9c_1^2c_2^4c_3 + 9n\alpha^4b^4\beta^9c_1c_2^6 - 704n\alpha^2b^4\beta^{11}c_1^3c_2^3c_3 + 192n\alpha^2b^4\beta^{11}c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 \\
& - n\alpha^2b^4\beta^{11}c_2^7 - 16n\alpha^4\beta^{13}c_1^2c_2^2c_3^3 - 16n\alpha^4\beta^{13}c_1c_2^4c_3^2 + 5n\alpha^4\beta^{13}c_2^6c_3 - 192\alpha^{12}b^4\beta^6c_1^6c_3 + 48\alpha^{12}b^4\beta^6c_1^5c_2^2 + 576\alpha^{10}b^4\beta^3c_1^5c_2c_3 - 144\alpha^{10}b^4\beta^3c_1^4c_2^3 \\
& - 3456\alpha^8b^4\beta^5c_1^5c_3^2 + 3120\alpha^8b^4\beta^5c_1^4c_2^2c_3 - 564\alpha^8b^4\beta^5c_1^3c_2^4 - 1664\alpha^6b^4\beta^7c_1^4c_2c_3^2 + 1696\alpha^6b^4\beta^7c_1^3c_2^3c_3 - 320\alpha^6b^4\beta^7c_1^2c_2^5 + 4416\alpha^4b^4\beta^9c_1^4c_3^3 \\
& - 2928\alpha^4b^4\beta^9c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 + 744\alpha^4b^4\beta^9c_1^2c_2^4c_3 - 72\alpha^4b^4\beta^9c_1c_2^6 + 64\alpha^2b^4\beta^{11}c_1^3c_2c_3^3 - 144\alpha^2b^4\beta^{11}c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 + 8\alpha^2b^4\beta^{11}c_2^7 - 304b^4\beta^{13}c_1^2c_2^2c_3^3 \\
& + 92b^4\beta^{13}c_1c_2^4c_3^2 - 4b^4\beta^{13}c_2^6c_3 + 192n\alpha^{10}b^2\beta^3c_1^5c_2c_3 - 48n\alpha^{10}b^2\beta^3c_1^4c_2^2 + 96n\alpha^8b^2\beta^5c_1^5c_2c_3 - 24n\alpha^8b^2\beta^5c_1^4c_2^3 - 1856n\alpha^6b^2\beta^7c_1^5c_3^2 - 44n\alpha^6b^2\beta^7c_1^4c_2^4 \\
& + 640n\alpha^6b^2\beta^7c_1^3c_2^2c_3 - 1632n\alpha^4b^2\beta^9c_1^4c_2c_3^2 + 480n\alpha^4b^2\beta^9c_1^3c_2^2c_3 - 18n\alpha^4b^2\beta^9c_1^2c_2^5 + 2176n\alpha^2b^2\beta^{11}c_1^4c_3^3 - 1872n\alpha^2b^2\beta^{11}c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 \\
& + 36n\alpha^2b^2\beta^{11}c_1^2c_2^4c_3 - 16n\alpha^2b^2\beta^{11}c_1c_2^6 + 320n\alpha^2\beta^{13}c_1^3c_2c_3^3 - 14n\alpha^2\beta^{13}c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 + 14n\alpha^2\beta^{13}c_1c_2^5c_3 + 3n\alpha^2\beta^{13}c_2^7 + 1152\alpha^{10}b^2\beta^3c_1^6c_3 - 288\alpha^{10}b^2\beta^3c_1^5c_2^2 \\
& + 1344\alpha^8b^2\beta^5c_1^5c_2c_3 - 336\alpha^8b^2\beta^5c_1^4c_2^2 + 5248\alpha^6b^2\beta^7c_1^5c_3^2 - 2816\alpha^6b^2\beta^7c_1^4c_2^2c_3 + 376\alpha^6b^2\beta^7c_1^3c_2^4 + 3264\alpha^4b^2\beta^9c_1^4c_2c_3^2 - 2496\alpha^4b^2\beta^9c_1^3c_2^3c_3 \\
& + 420\alpha^4b^2\beta^9c_1^2c_2^5 - 4352\alpha^2b^2\beta^{11}c_1^4c_3^3 + 2592\alpha^2b^2\beta^{11}c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 - 888\alpha^2b^2\beta^{11}c_1^2c_2^4c_3 + 128\alpha^2b^2\beta^{11}c_1c_2^6 - 640b^2\beta^{13}c_1^3c_2c_3^3 - 16b^2\beta^{13}c_1^2c_2^3c_3^2 \\
& + 68b^2\beta^{13}c_1c_2^5c_3 - 6b^2\beta^{13}c_2^7 - 256n\alpha^8\beta^5c_1^6c_3 + 64n\alpha^8\beta^5c_1^5c_2^2 - 512n\alpha^6\beta^7c_1^5c_2c_3 + 128n\alpha^6\beta^7c_1^4c_2^3 + 768n\alpha^4\beta^9c_1^5c_3^2 - 768n\alpha^4\beta^9c_1^4c_2^2c_3 \\
& + 144n\alpha^4\beta^9c_1^3c_2^4 + 768n\alpha^2\beta^{11}c_1^4c_2c_3^2 - 512n\alpha^2\beta^{11}c_1^3c_2^3c_3 + 80n\alpha^2\beta^{11}c_1^2c_2^5 - 512n\beta^{13}c_1^4c_3^3 + 576n\beta^{13}c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 - 208n\beta^{13}c_1^2c_2^4c_3 + 24n\beta^{13}c_1c_2^6 \\
& + 256\alpha^8\beta^5c_1^5c_2^2 - 2048\alpha^6\beta^7c_1^5c_2c_3 + 512\alpha^6\beta^7c_1^4c_2^3 - 3072\alpha^4\beta^9c_1^5c_3^2 + 192\alpha^4\beta^9c_1^4c_2^4 - 3072\alpha^2\beta^{11}c_1^4c_2c_3^2 - 1024\alpha^8\beta^5c_1^6c_3 + 1024\alpha^2\beta^{11}c_1^3c_2^3c_3 \\
& \left. - 64\alpha^2\beta^{11}c_1^2c_2^5 + 1024\beta^{13}c_1^4c_3^3 - 1536\beta^{13}c_1^3c_2^2c_3^2 + 512\beta^{13}c_1^2c_2^4c_3 - 48\beta^{13}c_1c_2^6 \right).
\end{aligned}$$

## REFERENCES

- [1] P. L. Antonelli, R. Ingarden and M. Matsumoto, *The Theory of Sprays and Finsler Spaces with Applications in Physics and Biology*, Kluwer Acad. Publ., Netherlands, 1993.
- [2] V. Balan and N. Brinzei, *Berwald-Moór type  $(h, v)$ -metric physical models*, Hypercomplex Numbers in Geometry and Physics, 2, 4 (2005), 114-122.
- [3] V. Balan and N. Brinzei, *Einstein equations for  $(h, v)$ -Berwald-Moór relativistic models*, Balkan. J. Geom. Appl. **11**(2) (2006), 20-27.
- [4] D. Bao and S.S. Chern, *A note on the Gauss-Bonnet theorem for Finsler spaces*, Ann. Math. **143**(1996), 233-252.
- [5] D. Bao and Z. Shen, *On the volume of unite tangent spheres in a Finsler space*, Results in Math. **26**(1994), 1-17.
- [6] B. Li and Z. Shen, *On projectively flat fourth root metrics*, Canad. Math. Bull. **55**(2012), 138-145.
- [7] B. Li and Z. Shen, *On a class of weakly Landsberg metrics*, Science in China, Series A, **50**(2007), 75-85.
- [8] M. Matsumoto, *Theory of Finsler spaces with  $m$ -th root metric. II*, Publ. Math. Debrecen. **49**(1996), 135-155.
- [9] M. Matsumoto and S. Numata, *On Finsler space with a cubic metric*, Tensor (N. S). **33**(2) (1979), 153-162.
- [10] D.G. Pavlov, *Four-dimensional time*, Hypercomplex Numbers in Geometry and Physics, Ed. "Mozet", Russia, **1**(2004), 31-39.
- [11] Z. Shen, *Differential Geometry of Spray and Finsler Spaces*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2001.
- [12] Z. Shen, *Finsler manifolds with nonpositive flag curvature and constant  $S$ -curvature*, Math. Z. **249**(2005), 625-639.
- [13] Z. Shen, *Some open problems in Finsler geometry*, <http://www.math.iupui.edu/~zshen/Research/preprintindex.htm>
- [14] H. Shimada, *On Finsler spaces with metric  $L = \sqrt[m]{a_{i_1 i_2 \dots i_m} y^{i_1} y^{i_2} \dots y^{i_m}}$* , Tensor, N.S. **33**(1979), 365-372.
- [15] A. Tayebi, *On generalized 4-th root metrics of isotropic scalar curvature*, Mathematica Slovaca, accepted.
- [16] A. Tayebi and M. Barzegari, *Generalized Berwald spaces with  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metrics*, Indagationes Mathematicae, **27** (2016), 670-683.
- [17] A. Tayebi and B. Najafi, *On  $m$ -th root Finsler metrics*, J. Geom. Phys. **61**(2011), 1479-1484.
- [18] A. Tayebi and B. Najafi, *On  $m$ -th root metrics with special curvature properties*, C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris, Ser. I. **349**(2011), 691-693.
- [19] A. Tayebi and M. Razgordani, *Four families of projectively flat Finsler metrics with  $\mathbf{K} = 1$  and their non-Riemannian curvature properties*, RACSAM, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13398-017-0443-2>.
- [20] A. Tayebi and H. Sadeghi, *On Cartan torsion of Finsler metrics*, Publ. Math. Debrecen. **82**(2) (2013), 461-471.
- [21] A. Tayebi and H. Sadeghi, *On generalized Douglas-Weyl  $(\alpha, \beta)$ -metrics*, Acta Mathematica Sinica, English Series, **31**(10) (2015), 1611-1620.
- [22] A. Tayebi and M. Shahbazi Nia, *On Matsumoto change of  $m$ -th root Finsler metrics*, Publications De L'institut Mathematique, tome **101**(115) (2017), 183-190.
- [23] A. Tayebi and M. Shahbazi Nia, *A new class of projectively flat Finsler metrics with constant flag curvature  $\mathbf{K} = 1$* , Differential Geom. Appl. **41**(2015), 123-133.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, FACULTY OF SCIENCE, UNIVERSITY OF QOM, QOM, IRAN.

*E-mail address:* akbar.tayebi@gmail.com

*E-mail address:* nezadiyan@gmail.com